

CoCoA-5 - Support #530

Interpreter error message: "for" with missing "do"

09 Apr 2014 15:12 - Anna Maria Bigatti

Status:	Rejected	Start date:	09 Apr 2014
Priority:	Normal	Due date:	
Assignee:		% Done:	100%
Category:	Parser/Interpreter	Estimated time:	1.01 hour
Target version:	CoCoA-5.4.0	Spent time:	0.70 hour
Description			
Why do we get different error messages?			
<pre>/**/ for i := 1 to 10 3; ERROR: I was expecting "Do" but I've found "3" for i := 1 to 10 3; ^ /**/ for i := 1 to 10 x; ERROR: Unexpected identifier, are you forgetting a "*" or a ";" ? for i := 1 to 10 x; ^</pre>			
Related issues:			
Related to CoCoA-5 - Feature #673: Error message: I was expecting...		Closed	11 Mar 2015

History

#1 - 24 Oct 2019 23:06 - John Abbott

Oh, that is strange.

I suppose the parser thinks that 10 x is more likely a typo for 10*x, but that 10 3 is probably not a typo for 10^3.

It might be pretty hard to fix this one sensibly, *i.e.* so that it gives a better message with 10 x.

Here is another test

```
for i:=1 to 10* do
```

This gives "Invalid start of expression", and then indicate the keyword "do" as the position of the error.

#2 - 24 Feb 2022 14:23 - John Abbott

- Target version changed from CoCoA-5.?.? to CoCoA-5.4.0

Is it really worth investing effort trying to fix this?

The err mesgs are inconsistent but nevertheless useful to the user (I think).

Reject?

#3 - 03 Mar 2022 15:46 - Anna Maria Bigatti

- Status changed from New to Rejected
- % Done changed from 0 to 100
- Estimated time set to 1.01 h

Thinking about it, this just follows our human expectation for "x".
If we had

```
/**/ for i := 1 to 10 N  
--> ERROR: Unexpected identifier; are you forgetting a "*" or a ";" ?
```

then the error message is much more plausible.

Although strange that two different error messages are given, they are equally good. Moreover, it would be quite hard to find how trying to fix them (and also, to do what??).

So, after discussing and testing, we decided to reject this issue.