CoCoA-5 - Feature #25

Function "Call"

08 Nov 2011 15:36 - Anna Maria Bigatti

Status:	Closed	**Start date:**	08 Nov 2011
Priority:	Normal	**Due date:**	
Assignee:	Anna Maria Bigatti	**% Done:**	100%
Category:	CoCoA-4 function: obsolete	**Estimated time:**	2.50 hours
Target version:	CoCoA-5.1.1 Seoul14	**Spent time:**	2.55 hours

Description

In CoCoA-5 there was a function called "Call"
(apply a function to given arguments)
called like this ;-)

```
  MyMax(Function("LT_Standard"),3,5);
```

Now it is pointless because we can call directly "LT_Standard(3,5);"
instead of calling it with "Call"   (having fun ;-)

Moreover in CoCoA-5 there is no function called "Function" to call (hahaha)

Now the serious question: should we keep "Call" for backward compatibility?

2014-08 Final decision: OBSOLETE

Related issues:

Related to CoCoA-5 - Design #532: New package: OBSOLESCENT	**Closed**	**09 Apr 2014**

History

#1 - 08 Nov 2011 15:37 - Anna Maria Bigatti

- Category set to CoCoA-4 function: obsolete

#2 - 08 Nov 2011 15:51 - John Abbott

JAA opposes the proposal because he thinks that it is no longer needed now that we have functions as first class objects (and he also thinks that **Call** was an ugly appendage). He is willing to be persuaded otherwise if a reasonable example can be found where **Call** produces a neater solution than using a first-class function value.

The lack of backward compatibility is unlikely to be a serious problem because **Call** was used only rarely (*e.g.* 6 times in the C4 packages).

#3 - 10 Nov 2011 17:10 - John Abbott

The **Call** function is used when running the C4 tests. Not sure how easy it will be to rewrite the code which runs the tests if **Call** is not available -- needs investigation.

#4 - 15 Nov 2011 12:50 - Anna Maria Bigatti

John Abbott wrote:

> The **Call** function is used when running the C4 tests. Not sure how easy it will be to rewrite the code which runs the tests if **Call** is not available -- needs investigation.

The only call I found in packages/ts/ is in DoTests which is not called.

I believe also other calls in the packages can be updated. (crossing fingers)

#5 - 01 Mar 2012 16:05 - John Abbott

- % Done changed from 0 to 50

Based on the premise "It is easier to add features later than to remove them", JAA suggests that we do not offer a Call function similar to that in C4.

If a genuine need for such a function arises then we can reconsider the question (but I doubt that the need will ever arise).

#6 - 01 Mar 2012 16:10 - John Abbott

A find-grep shows that Call appears in the following files:
cocoa5.cpkg
contrib/CantStop.cpkg
contrib/thmproving.cpkg
list.cpkg
man/help.cpkg
monomial_ideals.cpkg
ts/ts_lib.cpkg

Anna, could you very that all these uses can be easy replaced by other code in C5 (or even removed altogether).

#7 - 02 Apr 2014 17:33 - Anna Maria Bigatti

- Target version set to CoCoA-5.1.0 Easter14

#8 - 09 Apr 2014 17:47 - John Abbott

- Target version changed from CoCoA-5.1.0 Easter14 to CoCoA-5.1.1 Seoul14

#9 - 28 Jul 2014 17:01 - Anna Maria Bigatti

- Assignee set to Anna Maria Bigatti

- Estimated time set to 2.50 h

It is now officially documented as OBSOLETE, so I close this issue.

#10 - 01 Sep 2014 15:47 - John Abbott

- Status changed from New to Closed

- % Done changed from 50 to 100

Apparently this has already been done (but Anna forgot to "close" properly).