

CoCoA-5 - Bug #1524

wrong SystemCommand exit value

28 Oct 2020 09:56 - Julian Danner

Status:	Closed	Start date:	28 Oct 2020
Priority:	Normal	Due date:	
Assignee:	John Abbott	% Done:	100%
Category:	Portability	Estimated time:	0.66 hour
Target version:	CoCoA-5.4.0	Spent time:	0.60 hour
Description			
I just noticed that SystemCommand returns incorrect exit values, in particular the returned value is 'exit_val * 256'. You can check it yourself: <pre>[SystemCommand("exit " + Sprint(e)) e in 0..255] = (0..255) * 256;</pre>			
Related issues:			
Related to CoCoA-5 - Feature #1231: system command		Closed	26 Oct 2018

History

#1 - 28 Oct 2020 23:12 - John Abbott

- Category set to Portability
- Status changed from New to In Progress
- Target version set to CoCoA-5.4.0
- % Done changed from 0 to 10

According to cppreference, the return value of std::system is *implementation defined*.
The CoCoA manual was too specific (and thus wrong).

There is a way to obtain the process exit code on POSIX platforms, but that is not fully portable.

I have revised the CoCoA manual. At the moment the return value of SystemCommand conveys no information.

I wonder: should we change SystemCommand so that it returns NULL? That would make it clear that no information is available.

#2 - 30 Oct 2021 19:50 - John Abbott

- Related to Feature #1231: system command added

#3 - 05 Nov 2021 16:44 - John Abbott

- Status changed from In Progress to Feedback
- Assignee set to John Abbott
- % Done changed from 10 to 90

#4 - 10 Nov 2021 18:12 - John Abbott

My current opinion is to return the exit code, even if this is not well defined (in a portable way).

This would allow someone to use the command in programs for their own use e.g. a return code of 0 may well mean that the command succeeded (on many platforms)

#5 - 16 Feb 2022 19:53 - John Abbott

- *Status changed from Feedback to Closed*
- *% Done changed from 90 to 100*
- *Estimated time set to 0.66 h*

Julian did report verbally (quite some time ago) that he had had problems with SystemCommand working erratically: *i.e.* sometimes working, and sometimes not. I suppose the problem went away... it is hard to debug an intermittent problem on someone else's computer...

The manual has been updated to clarify that the return value may be platform dependent.

Closing.