

CoCoALib - Slug #1049

GroebnerFan: slow examples

19 Apr 2017 16:37 - John Abbott

Status:	In Progress	Start date:	19 Apr 2017
Priority:	Low	Due date:	
Assignee:		% Done:	10%
Category:	Various	Estimated time:	0.00 hour
Target version:	CoCoALib-1.0	Spent time:	2.50 hours
Description			
Possibly not too relevant to CoCoA(Lib), but I wanted to collect some challenging GFAN examples.			
Related issues:			
Related to CoCoA-5 - Slug #1047: NewPolyRing with user defined ordering is sl...		Closed	18 Apr 2017
Related to CoCoALib - Feature #780: GroebnerFan/ExternalLib-GFan: improve pac...		In Progress	24 Sep 2015
Related to CoCoALib - Slug #1057: Slug: Polynomial ring constructor slow with ...		In Progress	04 May 2017
Related to CoCoALib - Bug #1069: GroebnerFan: ERROR: Matrix must be invertible		In Progress	17 May 2017
Related to CoCoA-5 - Design #984: GroebnerFanIdeals: order matrices sometimes...		New	26 Nov 2016

History

#1 - 19 Apr 2017 16:41 - John Abbott

Here are some GroebnerFanIdeals examples which take a long time:

```
use QQ[x,y,z];
I := ideal(y^3*z -2*x^2*z +2*y^2,  y^4 -2*z^4 -x*y*z); --> more than 7200s
I := ideal(x*y*z^2 -y^2*z^2 -z^4 +2*x^3,  -2*z^4 +2*x*y^2 +2*x*y*z +y); --> about 11000s, maybe 625 cones

I := ideal(-2*z^4 +2*x*z^2 +2*z^3,  -2*y^5 -2*x^4*z -2*y^2*z^3); --> > 860s
I := ideal(x^5 +y^5 -y^2*z^2,  2*x^5 +x^3*y*z -2*x*z); --> >680 cones, long time (>7000s)
```

Some smaller examples:

```
I := ideal(2*x^3 +8*y^3 -y^2*z -6*z^3,  y^3 -5*x*z^2 +6*y*z +4*y); --> 1580s

I := ideal(-5*x^2*y -2*y^2*z +7*x*z +3,  5*x^3 -7*y^3 -5*y^2*z -7*x*y); --> 177 cones, 9s
I := ideal(2*x^3 +3*y^2*z +3*y -6,  9*x*y^2 +5*y^3 +x*z^2 -7*x^2); --> 129 cones, 170s
I := ideal(-2*y^3 -z^3 +4*z^2,  x*y*z +8*z^3 +7*x); --> 73 cones
I := ideal(4*x^3 -3*y^2*z +2*y,  6*x^2*y +5*y^3 +z^2); --> 76 cones
I := ideal(-6*y^2*z +9*z^3 +6*x^2,  -9*y^3 +8*x*z^2 +8*z); --> 76 cones
```

#2 - 19 Apr 2017 18:43 - Anna Maria Bigatti

- Related to Slug #1047: NewPolyRing with user defined ordering is slower than CoCoALib added

#3 - 19 Apr 2017 18:44 - Anna Maria Bigatti

- Related to Feature #780: GroebnerFan/ExternalLib-GFan: improve package added

#4 - 19 Apr 2017 20:56 - John Abbott

The following example fails:

```
GroebnerFanIdeals(ideal(x*y,y^3+x,y^3));
--> ERROR: MinBy: list is empty
--> WHERE: at line 283 (column 18) of list.cpkg5
-->   if L = [] then error("MinBy: list is empty"); endif;
-->   ^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^
CONTEXT: function MinBy at line 283 of list.cpkg5
CALLED BY: function OutEdge at line 165 of GroebnerFan.cpkg5
CALLED BY: function recursive at line 182 of GroebnerFan.cpkg5
CALLED BY: function GroebnerFanIdeals at line 228 of GroebnerFan.cpkg5
```

NOTE: this really ought to be a new issue... but hopefully Anna will fix it in a flash!

Another example:

```
GroebnerFanIdeals(ideal(y^2+y*z+1,y*z+z^2));
```

#5 - 20 Apr 2017 10:04 - Anna Maria Bigatti

John Abbott wrote:

NOTE: this really ought to be a new issue... but hopefully Anna will fix it in a flash!

Embarassing error in ReducedGBasis: I'll investigate.
(continuing this on [#780](#))

#6 - 21 Apr 2017 11:05 - Anna Maria Bigatti

- Subject changed from GFAN: slow examples to GroebnerFan: slow examples

#7 - 26 Apr 2017 15:31 - John Abbott

- Status changed from New to In Progress

- % Done changed from 0 to 10

Here is a strange example:

```
use QQ[x,y,z];
I := ideal(-2*x*y^2 + y^3 + 3*y^2*z - z, 2*y*z^2 + 3*x^2 + x*z - 2*x, -2*x^2*z + x*z^2 + z^3 + 3*z^2);
GFAN := GroebnerFanIdeals(I);
```

It computes 41 ideals then seems to get "stuck" for a long time (but does proceed slowly, using lots of RAM).

UPDATE it finished after about 13400s, and the fan contains 204 cones.

#8 - 26 Apr 2017 18:00 - John Abbott

Here are some examples with binomial ideals:

```
use QQ[x,y,z];
I := ideal(-4*x*y+10, 9*y^3+4*z^3, -8*x^3-2*y*z^2); --> 65 cones, 0.4s
I := ideal(-3*x^3 + 4*y^3, -3*x*y*z + 4*y, -3*x*y^2 - 4*z^3); --> 67 cones, 0.4s
I := ideal(-2*x^3 - 3*y*z^2, -4*y^3 - 3*z^3, -5*x^2*y + 3); --> 67 cones, 0.4s
I := ideal(5*x^2*z - 5, -3*z^3 + 5*x*y, y^3 - 3*x^2); --> 67 cones 0.4s
```

I do not have much "feel" for Groebner fans, but it did surprise me to find that even a binomial ideal can have such a large Gfan.

UPDATE

I ran a longer search and the computer produced these examples (1 trinomial and 2 binomials of degree 3)

```
Fan size: 473
3 ideals with big GFAN:
[
  ideal(65*y^2*z + 81*z^2 + 23, 63*x^3 + 69*y^3, 78*x^2*y + 21*z^3),
  ideal(30*x^2*z + 91*z^2 + 10, 8*x*y^2 + 48*z^3, 41*x^3 + 40*y^3),
  ideal(76*x*y^2 + 42*x^2 + 47, 53*x^3 + 41*y*z^2, 91*y^3 + 63*z^3)
]
Times taken were ["13.496", "13.946", "14.488"]
Slowest took 138.48
Slowest example: ideal(73*x*y^2 + 53*z^3 + 77*x*y, 90*x^3 + 44*y*z, 6*y^3 + 89*x)
```

As always, I suspect that the coeffs can be replaced by smaller ones.

#9 - 15 May 2017 10:40 - John Abbott

Here are some binomial examples of deg 4:

```
Fan size: 182
3 ideals with big GFAN:
[
  ideal(-34*z^4 -80*x*y, 52*y^4 -32*x^3, -88*x^3*z +22),
  ideal(20*z^4 +43*y^3, -33*x^4 +80*y*z, -88*x*y^3 +81),
  ideal(8*y^4 +26*x*z, 39*x^4 +39*z^3, -40*y*z^3 -98)
]
Times taken were ["1.2748", "1.2624", "1.2772"]
```

Probably the coeffs can be replaced by much smaller values (so long as the supports remain the same).

#10 - 15 May 2017 12:28 - John Abbott

Here are two deg 5 binomial examples:

```
Fan size: 338
1 ideals with big GFAN:
[
  ideal(60*x^2*y*z -96*x^2, 69*x^3*y^2 +52*z^5, 35*x^5 +3*x*y^4)
]
Times taken were ["2.9786"]
```

```
Fan size: 336
1 ideals with big GFAN:
[
  ideal(860*x^2*z^3 -453*x*z^2, 758*y^5 -356*x*z^4, 640*x^5 +802*y^2*z^3)
]
Times taken were ["3.1647"]
```

Again I believe only the supports are important; the coeffs can almost certainly be replaced by smaller ones.

An example in deg=7:

```
Fan size: 696
1 ideals with big GFAN:
[
  ideal(644*x^4*y^3 -519*x*z^6, -260*y^7 -553*x^4*z, 117*x^2*y*z^2 +24*x*y*z)
]
Times taken were ["7.1751"]
```

Here is a silly example (deg=9):

```
time 23.682 ideal(13*x^9 -88*z^4, -97*x^4*y^4*z -41*x^4*y^3, 81*x^2*z^7 +10*y^5)
```

GFAN size 1826

#11 - 16 May 2017 15:25 - Anna Maria Bigatti

- Related to Slug #1057: Slug: Polynomial ring constructor slow with (big) matrix ordering added

#12 - 17 May 2017 11:37 - John Abbott

- Related to Bug #1069: GroebnerFan: ERROR: Matrix must be invertible added

#13 - 19 May 2017 15:55 - John Abbott

```
Fan size: 634
1 ideals with big GFAN:
[
  ideal(80*x^3 +9*x*y^2 +10, 49*x^3 +32*y^2*z +36*z^2, 45*y^3 +85*z^3 +41)
]
Times taken were ["44.498"]
```

#14 - 23 May 2017 11:32 - John Abbott

Having 4 indets makes it easy to find "big" examples:

```
use QQ[x,y,z,t];
I := ideal(x*z^2+x*y+z, z^3+y^2*t, x^2*y+z*t^2, y*z^2+x); --> Time 800s, UnivDenom = 2*10^13090, NumCones = 61
94
I := ideal(y^2*z +t^3 +z*t, z*t^2 +z, x*z^2 +y*z*t, y*z^2 +x^2); --> Time 95200s, UniDenom = 1.4*10^19, NumCones = 820, MaxDenom = 1280
I := ideal(x^2*z +y*z +t, y^3 +x, x^3 +z^3, x^2*t +t^3); --> ERROR in ctor for MatrixOrdering after 158000s
(about 44hrs)
I := ideal(x*y*z +y*z*t +y, z^3 +x^2, y^2*z +t^3, x^3 +y^3); --> time 11800s, UnivDenom=2.5*10^379530, NumCones=36928
GF := GroebnerFanIdeals(I);
len(GF);
```

Even in deg 2 there are some hard examples:

```
I := ideal(x^2 +x*y +y*t, t^2 +z, z^2 +1, y^2 +t); --> UnivDenom = 2.7006*10^114, NumCones = 179, time = 7
.7s
I := ideal(x^2+x*z+z*t, y^2+t, z^2+y, t^2+1); --> UnivDenom = 2*10^104, time = 8.9s, NumCones = 198
I := ideal(z^2+y*t+x, t^2+y, x^2+z*t, y^2+1); --> UnivDenom = 8*10^80, NumCones = 232
```

#15 - 11 Mar 2024 11:12 - Anna Maria Bigatti

```
I := ideal(-5*x^2*y -2*y^2*z +7*x*z +3, 5*x^3 -7*y^3 -5*y^2*z -7*x*y); --> 177 cones, 9s  
t0 := CpuTime(); GFAN := GroebnerFanIdeals(I); TimeFrom(t0);
```

It is 20s on my computer. Maybe for a change I made in reduction/sugar?

#16 - 11 Mar 2024 11:15 - John Abbott

- *Related to Design #984: GroebnerFanIdeals: order matrices sometimes have "large" entries added*